CrimRxiv

Review 3 of "Noble Intent Is Not Enough to Run Veterans Court Mentoring Programs: A Qualitative Study of Mentors' Role Orientation and Responsibilities"

Caroline Jalain

Published on: Feb 16, 2021

License: [Creative Commons Attribution 4.0 International License \(CC-BY 4.0\)](https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by/4.0/)

Vote: Publish pending minor changes

[For votes to count, referees must reasonably explain why they voted as they did. Thus, please explain your vote. If you voted to publish pending minor changes, specify each change, why it is needed, and, possibly, how it should/could be done.]

This study contributes to the advancement of a much-needed research about the critical role of mentors in VTCs. While the research echoes findings from prior studies, it is also innovative as it does a very good job identifying and explaining three types of mentoring styles that are contributing to the lack of consistency in defining the role of mentors in VTCs. Interviews conducted with mentors, mentees and courtroom staff demonstrate how, even within the same courtroom, mentors are not perceived/do not perceive themselves in a comprehensive well-defined manner. I believe this is a good fit for this journal. There are a couple of limitations, but they do not detract from the overall quality of the paper. For example, while I understand the use of pseudonyms, Alan and James are used for both mentors and mentees, making the reader wonder if those are separate people or not. Additionally, interviews with team members were conducted but only one attorney was quoted in the paper. It seems as if more generalized comments were made regarding the opinions and perceptions of team members regarding the role of mentors in VTCs, but it would have been interesting to see quotes from judges, attorneys from both sides, court coordinators and probation.

[Please put additional info below, as/if you see fit.]

Minor changes for this study should include fixing errors in formatting

- For example, p. 11 "Jake a mentor, stated" is in bold
- P. 12 Mentor as sponsor/advocate is italicized instead of bold
- P. 18 I am not sure if this one is intentional but one sentence at the bottom of the page is in bold
- P. 19 half a sentence at the top of the page is in bold
- Spacing between the conclusion and references

Minor changes should also include deleting the references not included in the body of the paper. The following were found in the references but not in the paper:

- Allen, T. D., Lentz, E., & Day, R. (2006). Career success outcomes associated with mentoring others: A comparison of mentors and nonmentors. *Journal of Career Development*, 32(3), 272-285. DOI: [10.1177/0894845305282942](https://doi.org/10.1177/0894845305282942)
- Allen, T. D., Poteet, M. L., & Burroughs, S. M. (1997). The mentor's perspective: A qualitative inquiry and future research agenda. *Journal of vocational behavior*, 51(1), 70-89.

<http://dx.doi.org/10.1006/jvbe.1997.1596>

- Arora, R., & Rangnekar, S. (2014). Workplace mentoring and career resilience: An empirical test. *The Psychologist-Manager Journal*, 17(3), 205. DOI: 10.1037/MGR0000021
- Bozionelos, N., Kostopoulos, K., Van Der Heijden, B., Rousseau, D. M., Bozionelos, G., Hoyland, T., ... & Mikkelsen, A. (2016). Employability and job performance as links in the relationship between mentoring receipt and career success: a study in SMEs. *Group & organization management*, 41(2), 135-171. DOI: [10.1177/1059601115617086](https://doi.org/10.1177/1059601115617086)
- Byrne, M. W., & Keefe, M. R. (2002). Building research competence in nursing through mentoring. *Journal of nursing scholarship*, 34(4), 391-396. <https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1547-5069.2002.00391.x>
- DuBois, D. L., Portillo, N., Rhodes, J. E., Silverthorn, N., & Valentine, J. C. (2011). How effective are mentoring programs for youth? A systematic assessment of the evidence. *Psychological Science in the Public Interest*, 12(2), 57-91. DOI: [10.1177/1529100611414806](https://doi.org/10.1177/1529100611414806)
- Eby, L. T., Durley, J. R., Evans, S. C., & Ragins, B. R. (2006). The relationship between short-term mentoring benefits and long-term mentor outcomes. *Journal of Vocational Behavior*, 69(3), 424-444. DOI: 10.1016/j.jvb.2006.05.003
- Farley, C., & McClanahan, W. S. (2007). Ready4Work: In Brief. *Public/Private Ventures*, 6.
- Garcia, J. (2016). The importance of the mentor-mentee relationship in women's desistance from destructive behaviors. *International Journal of Offender Therapy and Comparative Criminology*, 60(7), 808-827. DOI: [10.1177/0306624X14568257](https://doi.org/10.1177/0306624X14568257)
- Gartner, A., & Riessman, F. (1993). Peer-Tutoring: Toward a New Model. ERIC Digest.
- Good, J., & Sherrid, P. (2005). When the Gates Open. *Philadelphia, PA: Public Private Ventures*.
- Hu, C., Wang, J. C., Sun, M. H., & Chen, H. H. (2008). Formal mentoring in military academies. *Military Psychology*, 20(3), 171-185.
- Hudson, P. (2013). Mentoring as professional development: 'growth for both' mentor and mentee. *Professional Development in Education*, 39(5), 771-783. DOI: 10.1080/19415257.2012.749415
- Hurd, N. M., Albright, J., Wittrup, A., Negrete, A., & Billingsley, J. (2018). Appraisal support from natural mentors, self-worth, and psychological distress: Examining the experiences of underrepresented students transitioning through college. *Journal of Youth and Adolescence*, 47(5), 1100-1112. DOI: 10.1007/s10964-017-0798-x
- Jang, S. J., Johnson, B. R., Hays, J., Hallett, M., & Duwe, G. (2020). Prisoners Helping Prisoners Change: A Study of Inmate Field Ministers Within Texas Prisons. *International Journal of Offender Therapy and Comparative Criminology*, 64(5), 470-497. DOI: [10.1177/0306624X19872966](https://doi.org/10.1177/0306624X19872966)
- Johnson, W. B., & Ridley, C. R. (2008). *The Elements of Mentoring*. St. Martin's Publishing Group. DOI: 10.1037/tep0000166
- Joliffe, D., & Farrington, D. P. (2007). *A rapid evidence assessment of the impact of mentoring on reoffending: A summary*. Home Office.

- Justice for Vets. (2015). *Veterans treatment court locations*. <http://www.justiceforvets.org/veterans-treatment-court-locations>.
- Matthews, E., Bowman, R., Whitbread, G., & Johnson, R. (2020). DC Central Kitchen: Peer mentoring, structure and self-empowerment play a critical role in desistance. *Journal of Offender Rehabilitation*, 59(1), 22-43. DOI: 10.1080/10509674.2019.1670319
- Mead, S., Hilton, D., & Curtis, L. (2001). Peer support: A theoretical perspective. *Psychiatric Rehabilitation Journal*, 25(2), 134. DOI: [10.1037/h0095032](https://doi.org/10.1037/h0095032)
- Meister, J. C., & Willyerd, K. (2010). Mentoring millennials. *Harvard Business Review*, 88(5), 68.
- Megginson, D. (2006). Mentoring in action: A practical guide. *Development and Learning in Organizations: An International Journal*. DOI:10.1108/hrmid.2006.04414gae.002
- Tang, L., Binns, C. W., Luo, C., Zhong, Z., & Lee, A. H. (2013). Determinants of breastfeeding at discharge in rural China. *Asia Pacific Journal of Clinical Nutrition*, 22(3), 443. DOI: 10.6133/apjcn.2013.22.3.20
- Timpe, Z. C., & Lunkenheimer, E. (2015). The long-term economic benefits of natural mentoring relationships for youth. *American Journal of Community Psychology*, 56(1-2), 12-24. DOI: 10.1007/s10464-015-9735-x
- Tolan, P., Henry, D., Schoeny, M., Bass, A., Lovegrove, P., & Nichols, E. (2013). *Mentoring interventions to affect juvenile delinquency and associated problems*. Campbell Collaboration. <https://campbellcollaboration.org/better-evidence/mentoring-juvenile-delinquency-and-associated-problems.html> DOI: 10.1007/s11292-013-9181-4
- Yirci, R., & Kocabas, I. (2010). The importance of mentoring for school principals: A conceptual analysis. *International Journal of Educational Leadership Preparation*, 2(5), 1-7. DOI:10.12973/EDUPIJ.2016.51.6

Minor revisions should include citations that are in the body of the paper in the references

- Farley & Hackman, 2006
- Justice for vets 2020