CrimRxiv

Review 1 of "Social Supports for Community-Supervised Offenders: Risk Factors or Protective Factors?"

Trish McCulloch

Published on: Jun 21, 2021

DOI: 10.21428/cb6ab371.b3c974b7

License: [Creative Commons Attribution 4.0 International License \(CC-BY 4.0\)](https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by/4.0/)

Vote: Publish pending minor changes

[For votes to count, referees must reasonably explain why they voted as they did. Thus, please explain your vote. If you voted to publish pending minor changes, specify each change, why it is needed, and, possibly, how it should/could be done.]

This is a very good paper which I enjoyed reading. It is, in my view, suitable for publication. I summarize its strengths below and highlight one area for consideration.

The paper is very well written and focuses on a relevant and under-researched topic. It adopts a novel methodology in attending to the perspectives of probationers/ parolees and their supporters (though see final comment below).

The literature review is clear and comprehensive and, unusually, considers both sides of the 'argument'.

The methodology is clear and robust.

The findings and discussion are clear, original and well connected to the existing literature.

Most of the key limitations of the study are discussed.

I suggest reflection on and review of one aspect, relating to the data analysis and reporting. The results don't show how probationers and parolees perceived the supports offered, specifically the extent to which they felt the particular supports discussed encouraged or discouraged offending. Instead, the focus and examples offered is on the views of the supporters and the speculations/ analysis of the authors. Why are probation/ parolee perspectives not included/ integrated?

Given the importance of probationer/ parolee perspectives on this, and that one of the claimed strengths of the study is its attention to the perspectives of probationer/ parolees and support persons, this emerged as an important area to either acknowledge or address.